IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA SOUTHERN DIVISION

)	
)	
)	
IN RE: BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD)	Master File No.:
ANTITRUST LITIGATION)	2:13-CV-20000-RDP
(MDL No. 2406))	
)	This document relates to all cases.
)	
)	
)	
	/	

PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSED MOTION TO COMPEL PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS BY BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD OF MICHIGAN

Come now Plaintiffs and respectfully move for an entry of an Order compelling

Defendant Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan to produce documents produced in the recentlysettled case, *Aetna, Inc. v. Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan*, No. 2:11-cv-15346-DPH-MKM

(E.D. Mich. 2011). In support for Plaintiffs' Motion, Plaintiffs rely on their Brief in Support of
Their Motion to Compel and In Opposition to Defendant Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan's
Motion for Protective Order filed simultaneously with this Motion.

Respectfully submitted the 1st day of September, 2015.

<u>Provider Track</u>	Subscriber Track
/s/ Joe R. Whatley, Jr. Joe R. Whatley, Jr. – Co-Lead Counsel W. Tucker Brown WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP 2001 Park Place North 1000 Park Place Tower Birmingham, AL 35203 Tel: (205) 488-1200 Fax: (800) 922-4851 Email: jwhatley@whatleykallas.com tbrown@whatleykallas.com	/s/ David Boies David Boies – Co-Lead Counsel BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP 333 Main Street Armonk, NY 10504 Tel: (914) 749-8200 Fax: (914) 749-8200 dboies@bsfllp.com
Edith M. Kallas – <i>Co-Lead Counsel</i> Patrick J. Sheehan WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP 1180 Avenue of the Americas, 20th Floor New York, NY 10036 Tel: (212) 447-7060 Fax: (800) 922-4851 Email: ekallas@whatleykallas.com psheehan@whatleykallas.com	Michael Hausfeld – <i>Co-Lead Counsel</i> William Butterfield – <i>Chair, Discovery Committee</i> HAUSFELD LLP 1700 K Street NW, Suite 650 Washington, DC 20006 Tel: (202) 540-7200 Fax: (202) 540-7201 mhausfeld@hausfeldllp.com wbutterfield@hausfeldllp.com
Henry C. Quillen WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP 159 Middle Street, Suite 2C Portsmouth, NH 03801 Tel: (603) 294-1591 Fax: (800) 922-4851 Email: hquillen@whatleykallas.com Deborah J. Winegard WHATLEY KALLAS, LLP 1068 Virginia Avenue, NE Atlanta, GA 30306 Tel: (404) 607, 8222	
Tel: (404) 607-8222 Fax: (404) 607-8451 Email: dwinegard@whatleykallas.com	

E. Kirk Wood, Jr. - Local Facilitating Counsel

WOOD LAW FIRM LLC

P. O. Box 382434 Birmingham, AL 35238

Tel: (205) 612-0243 Fax: (205) 705-1223

Email: ekirkwood1@bellsouth.net

Chris T. Hellums – *Local Facilitating Counsel* PITTMAN, DUTTON & HELLUMS, P.C. 2001 Park Place N, 1100 Park Place Tower

Birmingham, AL 35203 Tel: (205) 322-8880 Fax: (205) 328-2711

chrish@pittmandutton.com

/s/ Barry A. Ragsdale

Barry Alan Ragsdale – Plaintiffs' Liaison Counsel and Discovery Liaison Counsel

SIROTE & PERMUTT P.C.

P.O. Box 55727 Birmingham, AL 35255-5727

Tel: (205) 930-5114 Fax: (205) 212-2932

Email: bragsdale@sirote.com

Provider Track

J. Mark White – *Litigation Committee*

Augusta S. Dowd – *Chair, Litigation Committee* U.W. Clemon – *Plaintiffs' Steering Committee*

Linda G. Flippo – ${\it Discovery\ Committee}$

WHITE ARNOLD & DOWD, P.C. The Massey Building

2025 Third Avenue North, Suite 500

Birmingham, AL 35203 Tel: (205) 323-1888 Fax: (205) 323-8907

Email: uwclemon@whitearnolddowd.com

adowd@whitearnolddowd.com mwhite@whitearnolddowd.com

Subscriber Track

William A. Isaacson – *Settlement Committee*

& PSC Member

BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

5301 Wisconsin Avenue NW Washington, DC 20015

Tel: (202) 237-2727 Fax: (202) 237-6131 wisaacson@bsfllp.com

Aaron S. Podhurst – *Plaintiffs' Steering*

Committee

Peter Prieto – *Chair, Expert Committee* PODHURST ORSECK, P.A.

25 West Flagler Street, Suite 800

Miami, FL 33130 Tel: (305) 358-2800 Fax: (305) 358-2382

Email: apodhurst@podhurst.com

pprieto@podhurst.com

Gregory Davis – Settlement Committee & PSC

Member

DAVIS & TALIAFERRO, LLC 7031 Halcyon Park Drive

Montgomery, AL 36117

Tel: (334) 832-9080 Fax: (334) 409-7001 gldavis@knology.net Debra B. Hayes – *Plaintiffs' Steering Committee*

Charles Clinton Hunter THE HAYES LAW FIRM 700 Rockmead, Suite 210 Kingwood, TX 77339

Tel: (281) 815-4963 Fax: (832) 575-4759 dhayes@dhayeslaw.com chunter@dhayeslaw.com Megan Jones – Settlement Committee & PSC

Member

Arthur Bailey – *Discovery Committee*

HAUSFELD LLP

44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3400

San Francisco, CA 94104 Tel: (415) 744-1970 Fax: (415) 358-4980 mjones@hausfeldllp.com

abailey@hausfeldllp.com

Dennis Pantazis - Plaintiffs' Steering Committee

Brian Clark – *Discovery Committee*

WIGGINS CHILDS PANTAZIS FISHER

GOLDFARB

The Kress Building

301 Nineteenth Street North Birmingham, AL 35203 Tel: (205) 314-0500

Fax: (205) 254-1500 Email: dgp@wcqp.com bclark@wcqp.com

Dennis C. Reich - Chair, Damages Committee

REICH & BINSTOCK, LLP 4265 San Felipe, Suite 1000

Houston, TX 77027 Tel: (713) 622-7271 Fax: (713) 623-8724 Email: dreich@rbfirm.net Kathleen Chavez – *Settlement Committee & PSC Member*

FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL, LLC

10 West State Street, Suite 200

Geneva, IL 60134 Tel: (630) 797-3339 Fax: (630) 232-7452 kcc@fmcolaw.com

Nicholas B. Roth – *Chair, Discovery Committee*Julia Smeds Roth – *Discovery Committee*EYSTER KEY TUBB ROTH MIDDLETON &

ADAMS, LLP 402 East Moulton Street Decatur, AL 35601 Tel: (256) 353-6761

Fax: (256) 353-6767

Email: nroth@eysterkey.com jroth@eysterkey.com

Cyril V. Smith – Settlement Committee & PSC Member

ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER, LLP 100 East Pratt Street, Suite 2440 Baltimore, MD 21202-1031

Tel: (410) 949-1145 Fax: (410) 659-0436 csmith@zuckerman.com Robert J. Axelrod - Chair, Written Submissions

Committee

AXELROD & DEAN LLP 830 Third Avenue, 5th Floor

New York, NY 10022 Tel: (646) 448-5263 Fax: (212) 840-8560

Email: rjaxelrod@axelroddean.com

Eric L. Cramer – *Expert Committee* BERGER & MONTAGUE, P.C.

1622 Locust Street Philadelphia, PA 19103 Tel: 1-800-424-6690 Fax: (215) 875-4604 ecramer@bm.net

Van Bunch – Chair, Class Certification Committee

BONNETT FAIRBOURN FRIEDMAN & BALINT, P.C.

2325 E. Camelback Road, Suite 300

Phoenix, AZ 85016 Tel: (602) 274-1100 Fax: (602) 274-1199 Email: vbunch@bffb.com Richard A. Feinstein – Co-Chair, Expert

Committee
Karen Dyer – Expert Committee

Hamish P.M. Hume – *Discovery Committee*Kathleen Kiernan – *Written Submissions*

Committee

BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

5301 Wisconsin Avenue NW Washington, DC 20015
Tel: (202) 237-2727
Fax: (202) 237-6131
tchutkan@bsfllp.com
kdyer@bsfllp.com

hhume@bsfllp.com kkiernan@bsfllp.com

David A. Balto – *Expert Committee* DAVID A. BALTO LAW OFFICES 1350 I Street, N.W., Suite 850

Washington, DC 20005 Tel: (202) 789-5424 Fax: (202) 589-1819

Email: david.balto@dcantitrustlaw.com

Patrick Cafferty – *Discovery Committee* CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &

SPRENGEL LLP 101 North Main Street, Suite 565

Ann Arbor, MI 48104 Tel: (734) 769-2144 Fax: (734) 769-1207

pcafferty@caffertyclobes.com

Peter H. Burke - Class Certification Committee

J. Allen Schreiber – Litigation Committee

BURKE HARVEY, LLC 3535 Grandview Parkway

Suite 100

Birmingham, AL 35243 Tel: (205) 930-9091 Fax: (205) 930-9054

Email: pburke@burkeharvey.com

aschreiber@burkeharvey.com

Richard S. Frankowski – Discovery Committee

THE FRANKOWSKI FIRM, LLC 231 22nd Street South, Suite 203

Birmingham, AL 35233 Tel: (205) 390-0399 Fax: (205) 390-1001

Email: richard@frankowskifirm.com

Bryan Clobes – *Litigation Committee*Ellen Meriwether – *Written Submissions Committee*

CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &

SPRENGEL LLP

1101 Market Street, Suite 2650

Philadelphia, PA 19107 Tel: (215) 864-2800 Fax: (215) 864-2810

<u>bclobes@caffertyclobes.com</u> <u>emeriwether@caffertyclobes.com</u>

John C. Davis – Written Submissions Committee

LAW OFFICE OF JOHN C. DAVIS

623 Beard Street Tallahassee, FL 32303 Tel: (850) 222-4770

Email: john@johndavislaw.net

Douglas Dellaccio – *Litigation Committee* CORY WATSON CROWDER & DEGARIS,

P.C.

2131 Magnolia Avenue, Suite 200

Birmingham, AL 32505 Tel: (205) 328-2200 Fax: (205) 324-7896 ddellaccio@cwcd.com

Lynn W. Jinks, III – *Expert Committee*Christina D. Crow – *Discovery Committee*

JINKS CROW & DICKSON, P.C.

219 North Prairie Street Union Springs, AL 36089 Tel: (334) 738-4225 Fax: (334) 738-4229

Email: <u>ljinks@jinkslaw.com</u>

ccrow@jinkslaw.com

Chris Cowan – Damages Committee

THE COWAN LAW FIRM One Meadows Building

5005 Greenville Avenue, Suite 200

Dallas, TX 75206 Tel: (214) 826-1900 Fax: (214) 826-8900 chris@cowanlaw.net

W. Daniel Miles, III – Written Submissions	Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr.
Committee	Benjamin Sweet – <i>Litigation Committee</i>
BEASLEY ALLEN CROW METHVIN PORTIS	CARLSON LYNCH LTD
& MILES, P.C.	115 Federal St., Suite 210
218 Commerce Street	Pittsburgh, PA 15212
Montgomery, AL 36104	Tel: (412) 322-9243
Tel: (800) 898-2034	Fax: (412) 231-0246
Fax: (334) 954-7555	ekilpela@carlsonlynch.com
Email: dee.miles@beasleyallen.com	bsweet@carlsonlynch.com
Joey K. James – Litigation Committee	Robert M. Foote – Damages Committee
BUNCH & JAMES	FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL, LLC
P. O. Box 878	10 West State Street, Suite 200
Florence, AL 35631	Geneva, IL 60134
Tel: (256) 764-0095	Tel: (630) 797-3339
Fax: (256) 767-5705	Fax: (630) 232-7452
Email: joey@bunchandjames.com	rmf@fmcolaw.com
Mark K. Gray – Discovery Committee	Charles T. Caliendo – <i>Class Certification</i>
GRAY & WHITE	Committee
713 E. Market Street, Suite 200	GRANT & EISENHOFER
Louisville, KY 40202	485 Lexington Avenue
Tel: (502) 805-1800	New York, NY 10017
Fax: (502) 618-4059	Tel: (646) 722-8500
Email: mgray@grayandwhitelaw.com	Fax: (646) 722-8501
	ccaliendo@gelaw.com
Stephen M. Hansen – <i>Class Certification</i>	Robert Eisler – <i>Discovery Committee</i>
Committee	GRANT & EISENHOFER
LAW OFFICE OF STEPHEN M. HANSEN	123 Justison Street
1821 Dock Street	Wilmington, DE 19801
Tacoma, WA 98402	Tel: (302) 622-7000
Tel: (253) 302-5955	Fax: (302) 622-7100
Fax: (253) 301-1147	reisler@gelaw.com
Email: steve@stephenmhansenlaw.com	

Harley S. Tropin – Damages Committee	David Guin – Chair, Written Submissions
Javier A. Lopez – <i>Discovery Committee</i>	Committee
KOZYAK TROPIN &	Tammy Stokes – <i>Damages Committee</i>
THROCKMORTON, P.A.	GUIN, STOKES & EVANS, LLC
2525 Ponce De Leon Boulevard, 9th Floor	The Financial Center
Miami, FL 33134	505 20th Street North, Suite 1000
Tel: (305) 372-1800	Birmingham, AL 35203
Fax: (305) 372-3508	Tel: (205) 226-2282
Email: hst@kttlaw.com	Fax: (205) 226-2357
jal@kttlaw.com	davidg@gseattorneys.com
	tammys@gseattorneys.com
C. Wes Pittman – Settlement Committee	Daniel Gustafson – <i>Litigation Committee</i>
THE PITTMAN FIRM, P.A.	Daniel C. Hedlund – <i>Damages Committee</i>
432 McKenzie Avenue	GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC
Panama City, FL 32401	120 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600
Tel: (850) 784-9000	Minneapolis, MN 55402
Fax: (850) 763-6787	Tel: (612) 333-8844
Email: wes@pittmanfirm.com	Fax: (612) 339-6622
	dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com
	dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com
Robert B. Roden – <i>Litigation Committee</i>	Brent Hazzard – <i>Litigation Committee</i>
SHELBY RODEN, LLC	HAZZARD LAW, LLC
2956 Rhodes Circle	447 Northpark Drive
Birmingham, AL 35205	Ridgeland, MS 39157
Tel: (205) 933-8383	Tel: (601) 977-5253
Fax: (205) 933-8386	Fax: (601) 977-5236
Email: <u>rroden@shelbyroden.com</u>	brenthazzard@yahoo.com
Gary E. Mason – Class Certification Committee	John Saxon – <i>Litigation Committee</i>
WHITFIELD BRYSON & MASON, LLP	JOHN D. SAXON, P.C.
1625 Massachusetts Ave. NW, Suite 605	2119 3rd Avenue North
Washington, DK 20036	Birmingham, AL 35203-3314
Tel: (202) 429-2290	Tel: (205) 324-0223
Fax: (202) 640-1160	Fax: (205) 323-1583
Email: gmason@wbmllp.com	jsaxon@saxonattorneys.com

T N' 1 1 C	1 1 D C 1
Lance Michael Sears	Lawrence Jones – Damages Committee
SEARS & SWANSON, P.C.	JONES WARD PLC
First Bank Building	312 South Fourth Street, Sixth Floor
2 North Cascade Avenue, Suite 1250	Louisville, KY 40202
Colorado Springs, CO 80903	Tel: (502) 882-6000
Tel: (719) 471-1984	larry@jonesward.com
Fax: (719) 577-4356	
Email: <u>lance@searsassociates.com</u>	
Mid-al-C Dada E	Andrew Learning Chair Diagram
Michael C. Dodge – Expert Committee	Andrew Lemmon – <i>Chair, Discovery</i>
GLAST PHILLIPS & MURRAY, P.C.	Committee
14801 Quorum Drive, Suite 500	LEMMON LAW FIRM
Dallas, TX 75254	650 Poydras Street, Suite 2335
Tel: (972) 419-7172	New Orleans, LA 70130
Email: mdodge@gpm-law.com	Tel: (504) 581-5644
	Fax: (504) 581-2156
	andrew@lemmonlawfirm.com
Michael E. Gurley, Jr. – <i>Discovery Committee</i>	Virginia Buchanan – <i>Chair, Class</i>
Attorney at Law	Certification Committee
24108 Portobello Road	LEVIN PAPANTONIO THOMAS
Birmingham, AL 35242	MITCHELL RAFFERTY & PROCTOR, P.A.
Tel: (205) 908-6512	316 South Baylen Street, Suite 600
` '	
Email: Michael@gurleylaw.net	Pensacola, FL 32502
	Tel: (850) 435-7000
	Fax: (850) 435-7020
	vbuchanan@levinlaw.com
Myron C. Penn – <i>Discovery Committee</i>	Robert Methvin – <i>Chair, Settlement</i>
PENN & SEABORN, LLC	Committee
53 Highway 110	James M. Terrell – <i>Class Certification</i>
Post Office Box 5335	Committee
Union Springs, AL 36089	MCCALLUM, METHVIN & TERRELL, P.C.
Tel: (334) 738-4486	The Highland Building
Fax: (334) 738-4432	2201 Arlington Avenue South
Email: myronpenn28@hotmail.com	Birmingham, AL 35205
myronpoinizo e nounum.com	Tel: (205) 939-0199
	Fax: (205) 939-0399
	rgm@mmlaw.net
	iterrell@mmlaw.net
	justicine miniaw.net

T A. D.1 Director Committee	Mi-11M-C11 Class C
Troy A. Doles – <i>Discovery Committee</i>	Michael McGartland – Class Certification
SCHLICHTER BOGARD & DENTON, LLP	Committee
100 S. 4th Street, Suite 900	MCGARTLAND & BORCHARDT LLP
St. Louis, MO 63102	1300 South University Drive, Suite 500
Tel: (314) 621-6115	Fort Worth, TX 76107
Fax: (314) 621-7151	Tel: (817) 332-9300
Email: tdoles@uselaws.com	Fax: (817) 332-9301
	mike@attorneysmb.com
J. Preston Strom, Jr. – <i>Litigation Committee</i>	H. Lewis Gillis – Co-Head Chair, Litigation
STROM LAW FIRM, LLC	Committee
2110 N. Beltline Boulevard, Suite A	MEANS GILLIS LAW, LLC
Columbia, SC 29204-3905	3121 Zelda Court
Tel: (803) 252-4800	Montgomery, AL 36106
	Tel: 1-800-626-9684
Fax: (803) 252-4801	
Email: petestrom@stromlaw.com	hlgillis@tmgslaw.com
THE ALP I DI C	
Thomas V. Bender – <i>Discovery Committee</i>	David J. Hodge – Chair, Settlement
WALTERS BENDER STROHBEHN	Committee
& VAUGHAN, P.C.	MORRIS, KING & HODGE
2500 City Center Square, 1100 Main	200 Pratt Avenue NE
Kansas City, MO 64105	Huntsville, AL 35801
Tel: (816) 421-6620	Tel: (256) 536-0588
Fax: (816) 421-4747	Fax: (256) 533-1504
Email: tbender@wbsvlaw.com	lstewart@alinjurylaw.com
Michael L. Murphy – <i>Discovery Committee</i>	Dianne M. Nast – Class Certification
BAILEY GLASSER LLP	Committee
910 17 th Street, NW, Suite 800	NASTLAW LLC
Washington, DC 20006	1101 Market Street, Suite 2801
Tel: (202) 463-2101	Philadelphia, PA 19107
Fax: (202) 463-2103	Tel: (215) 923-9300
mmurphy@baileyglasser.com	Fax: (215) 923-9302
	dnast@nastlaw.com
	Simot Chaptan iooni
Brian E. Wojtalewicz	Patrick W. Pendley – <i>Chair</i> , <i>Damages</i>
WOJTALEWICZ LAW FIRM, LTD.	Committee
139 N. Miles Street	Christopher Coffin – <i>State Liaison Committee</i>
Appleton, MN 56208	PENDLEY, BAUDIN & COFFIN, LLP
Tel: (320) 289-2363	Post Office Drawer 71
Fax: (320) 289-2369	Plaquemine, LA 70765
Email: <u>brian@wojtalewiczlawfirm.com</u>	Tel: (225) 687-6369
	pwpendley@pbclawfirm.com
	ccoffin@pbclawfirm.com

Archie C. Lamb, Jr. ARCHIE LAMB & ASSOCIATES, LLC 2900 1st Avenue South Birmingham, AL 352333 (205) 324-4644 (205) 324-4649 Fax alamb@archielamb.com	Edgar D. Gankendorff – <i>Co-Head Chair</i> , <i>Litigation Committee</i> Eric R.G. Belin – <i>Damages Committee</i> PROVOSTY & GANKENDORFF, LLC 650 Poydras Street, Suite 2700 New Orleans, LA 70130 Tel: (504) 410-2795 Fax: (504) 410-2796 egankendorff@provostylaw.com ebelin@provostylaw.com
Paul Lundberg LUNDBERG LAW, PLC 600 4 TH Street, Suite 906 Sioux City, IA 51101 Tel: (712) 234-3030 Fax: (712) 234-3034 Email: paul@lundberglawfirm.com	Richard Rouco – Written Submissions Committee QUINN, CONNOR, WEAVER, DAVIES & ROUCO LLP Two North Twentieth Street 2 – 20 th Street North, Suite 930 Birmingham, AL 35203 Tel: (205) 870-9989 Fax: (205) 870-9989 rrouco@qcwdr.com
Jessica Dillon Ray R. Brown Molly Brown DILLON & FINDLEY, P.C. 1049 W. 5 th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 Tel: (907) 277-5400 Fax: (907) 277-9896 Email: Jessica@dillonfindley.com Ray@dillonfindley.com Molly@dillonfindley.com	Garrett Blanchfield – Written Submissions Committee REINHARDT, WENDORF & BLANCHFIELD E-1250 First National Bank Building 332 Minnesota Street St. Paul, MN 55101 Tel: (651) 287-2100 Fax: (651) 287-2103 g.blanchfield@rwblawfirm.com
James Redmond Cynthia C. Moser HEIDMAN LAW FIRM 1128 Historic 4 th Street P. O. Box 3086 Sioux City, IA 51101 Tel: (712) 255-8838 Fax (712) 258-6714 Email: Jim.Redmond@heidmanlaw.com Cynthia.Moser@heidmanlaw.com	Jason Thompson – <i>Damages Committee</i> SOMMERS SCHWARTZ One Towne Square, 17th Floor Southfield, MI 48076 Tel: (248) 355-0300 jthompson@sommerspc.com

Gwen Simons	Larry McDevitt – <i>Chair, Class Certification</i>
Simons & Associates Law, P.A.	Committee
P.O. Box 1238	David Wilkerson – <i>Discovery Committee</i>
Scarborough, ME 04070-1238	VAN WINKLE LAW FIRM
Tel: (207) 205-2045	11 North Market Street
Fax: (207) 883-7225	Asheville, NC 28801
Email: gwen@simonsassociateslaw.com	Tel: (828) 258-2991
	lmcdevitt@vwlawfirm.com
	dwilkerson@vwlawfirm.com
	Carl S. Kravitz – <i>Expert Committee</i>
	ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER LLP
	1800 M Street NW, Suite 1000
	Washington, DC 20036-5807
	Tel: (202) 778-1800
	Fax: (202) 822-8106
	ckravitz@zuckerman.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have on this 1st day of September, 2015, electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

/s/ Joe R. Whatley, Jr.
Joe R. Whatley, Jr.